

8. Transportation

Environmental Advocates of New York

There is excellent information in the Draft State Energy Plan regarding advanced technology and alternative vehicles. Environmental Advocates would like to see a systems-benefit-charge model used for vehicles. A registration fee for vehicles with a sliding scale based on fuel efficiency could be a source of income to the State to pay for additional programs. Even if the increment was not adequate to change behavior it would serve as an educational tool.

Other programs that could be implemented include clean-car labeling and marketing programs that could be offered cooperatively with the State's auto dealers. Low-interest grant programs for school districts to purchase low-emission and alternative-fuel vehicles could be offered. Programs could be developed whereby the State would give priority to procurement of clean vehicle fleets.

Response: The State is committed to the low-emission vehicle program and is enforcing its adoption. A number of programs, such as the Clean Water/Clean Air Bond Act and the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality program in non-attainment and maintenance areas, can provide funding for the purchase of low-emission and alternative fuel vehicles and consumer education and outreach. Significant assistance for these types of activities is provided through normal transportation funding mechanisms that are administered by the New York State Department of Transportation and local transportation agencies, operating through Metropolitan Planning Organizations. At this time, the Energy Planning Board does not recommend a system benefits charge model for vehicles.

Environmental Advocates of New York

The Draft State Energy Plan has good objectives for transportation and good goals. What it doesn't have is specific numerical metrics on reaching the goals, e.g., what should the modal split be, what should the vehicle miles traveled (VMT) reductions be, what do we need in terms of advanced technology vehicle inventory? There should be measurable goals in the State Energy Plan and then a menu of options on how we could get there.

Response: Trends in VMT and mode share are already reported and available. In recommending specific goals for greenhouse gas reductions and outcomes from energy efficiency improvements, the State Energy Plan establishes metrics to make all sectors,

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

including the transportation sector, more energy efficient. Separate metrics for individual sectors are unnecessary.

Renewable Energy Works

Following the lead of the U.S. Department of Agriculture, New York should begin using clean-burning, renewable bio-diesel in its numerous fleets.

Response: The State Energy Plan encourages the federal government to adopt new corporate average fuel economy standards for vehicles and address vehicle energy efficiency in a way that protects driver and passenger safety. The Energy Plan supports expanding the use of bio-fuels and supports the commercialization of biofuels technology and use of biofuels as vehicle fuels. As with any fuel, including other alternative fuels, before widespread use and acceptance can be realized, questions related to issues such as availability of supplies, price differentials among fuels, and cold weather operations must be satisfactorily addressed.

Green Party Broome County

New York State should provide funds for county and municipal bus systems to convert their bus fleets to propane, hydrogen fuel cells, and other alternative, non-petroleum fuels.

However, simply converting buses to cleaner burning fuels isn't enough. The State must allocate funds to county and municipal governments for the expansion and improvement of county and municipal public transportation systems. Fleet sizes must be increased and service must become more frequent. Park-and-ride programs must be created or expanded where they already exist to incorporate suburban and rural residents in public transportation systems.

Response: As discussed in the State Energy Plan, Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, the State is already providing funding for the conversion of county and municipal bus fleets to alternative fuels using sources of funding such as the Clean Water/Clean Air Bond Act and the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality program in non-attainment and maintenance areas. This funding is used for building alternative fuel infrastructure and transit development. This support is expected to continue.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

Green Party Broome County

The price of gas should be raised. Increased gasoline taxes would provide much needed revenue for the State and an increase in the price of gasoline would encourage the use of public transportation.

Response: Transportation experts generally recognize that changes in the price of gasoline, including taxes, do not significantly affect driving behavior. Generally, the same level of driving occurs regardless of the price of gasoline. As evidence, it should be noted that the recent volatility in the gasoline prices has not been associated with significant changes in vehicle miles traveled. Raising gasoline taxes may have adverse effects on low-income communities and small businesses. The Energy Planning Board does not recommend raising gasoline taxes at this time.

Green Party Broome County

Bicycle racks should be installed on every block in urban areas and on the front of all buses. State funding should be provided to municipal governments to create bicycle lanes on city streets and to improve existing bicycle lanes.

Response: Bicycle lanes and bicycle racks are funded by the State, as well. The New York State Department of Transportation recently enacted a policy to allow State funding to be used for stand-alone bicycle and pedestrian projects in locally owned rights-of-way. Previously, bicycle and pedestrian projects had to be part of roadway construction projects. Municipal governments are allowed to give priority to bicycle and pedestrian projects, if they choose to do so.

Charles Sontag

I think we could do more from the State standpoint in encouraging better public transportation, such as the trams in use in Germany. I would ask the State to pursue such technologies; transportation policies are ultimately energy policies. I see this as good savings.

We should support Pennsylvania and New Jersey's rebuilding of the Lackawanna cutoff and the return of rail service to Scranton, then Binghamton and Elmira, and, possibly, points west.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

Tom Salo

The State Energy Plan should adopt a funding policy that favors investment in public transportation.

Kenya Browning

High speed rail, as outlined on page 2-81 of the Draft State Energy Plan, seems promising.

Response: The State Energy Plan, Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, discusses the State's actions and policies with respect to public transportation. Activities include technology improvements as well as programs to promote improved service and reliability. The Energy Plan supports the contention that public transportation is energy efficient.

The State supports the return of rail service to New York. Section 2.4 describes in detail the actions the State is initiating to encourage this.

Western New York Sustainable Energy Association

Stop highway construction that promotes sprawl and increases vehicle miles driven. The Draft State Energy Plan mentions highway capital projects that decrease energy use through mobility improvements. What about highway capital projects that increase energy use by encouraging sprawl? The Draft State Energy Plan should discuss the latter type of project and call for reevaluation and reconsideration of those projects.

Response: Many factors go into the decisionmaking process before a major highway capital project is constructed. One important factor is energy use. As discussed in Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, many of these projects decrease energy use by improving mobility. Concerns about specific highway projects should be pursued during the environmental review phase of the project that includes local public review and comment. Appropriate Department of Transportation Regional Offices should be contacted with specific concerns and comments.

Western New York Sustainable Energy Association

The Governor and the State Legislature and the Draft State Energy Plan should loudly and tirelessly insist that the CAFE standards be improved and that loopholes be closed.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

Response: The State Energy Plan encourages the federal government to adopt new corporate average fuel economy standards for vehicles and to address vehicle energy efficiency in a way that protects drivers and passengers.

Green Party Erie County

Obviously automobiles use a large supply of foreign oil. Why isn't this plan addressing with specific numbers reducing that dependence on foreign oil? Why aren't we talking about major increases in mass transit aid. CAFE and other things need to be put into place. Don't ignore the issue.

Response: The State Energy Plan encourages the federal government to adopt new corporate average fuel economy standards for vehicles and to address vehicle energy efficiency in a way that protects drivers and passengers. Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, identifies anticipated increases in aid to public transportation.

In supporting specific goals for greenhouse gas reductions and energy efficiency improvements, the State Energy Plan establishes metrics for making all sectors, including the transportation sector, more energy efficient. Separate specific metrics for reducing the dependence on foreign oil are then unnecessary since improving the energy efficiency of the transportation sector will result in reduction in New York's dependence on foreign oil.

David Stout

Sellers of vehicles must make mid-sized, four-passenger, alternative-fuel vehicles available for purchase throughout the State. The refueling infrastructure must be accessible as well for these vehicles. A minimum miles per gallon of 30 for all new internal combustion engines should be required.

The Draft State Energy Plan must assure that there's a change in transportation pollution from use of fossil fuels and poor mile-per-gallon vehicles. We need definable goals.

Renewable Energy Works

New York should put pressure on the federal government to raise catalytic standards for all passenger vehicles.

Response: Under federal law, New York is precluded from establishing separate vehicle standards. New York's only option was to adopt California vehicle standards, which was done. For this reason, the State Energy Plan encourages the federal

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

government to adopt new corporate average fuel economy standards for vehicles and to address vehicle energy efficiency in a way that protects drivers and passengers.

In supporting specific goals for greenhouse gas reductions and energy efficiency improvements, the State Energy Plan establishes metrics for making all sectors, including the transportation sector, more energy efficient. Separate metrics for the transportation sector are unnecessary.

Erin Cala

The transportation section of the Draft State Energy Plan must be more aggressive and specific. We need numerical goals regarding fuel efficiency. Yes, we should meet the California low emission vehicle standards, but we need a time line and a set percentage of money devoted to these goals. We need more devoted to public transit systems and research and development so we can have a well thought out and effective public transit.

Response: In supporting specific goals for greenhouse gas reductions and energy efficiency improvements, the State Energy Plan establishes energy efficiency metrics for all sectors, including the transportation sector.

Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, supports the idea that an effective public transit system is essential and describes how New York is accomplishing this goal through research and development and appropriate funding.

Sierra Club, Long Island Group

We should improve transportation. We need more mass transit, more trains, more public transit that relies on natural gas rather than gasoline, and government should lead the project in purchasing these types of energy-efficient vehicles for their own fleets.

Response: New York is continually striving to improve transportation. The Energy and Transportation issue report (see Section 2.4 of the State Energy Plan) describes the actions the State and other transportation providers are taking to increase transit ridership, improve service, and increase the use of alternative fuels. The State is leading by example by purchasing alternative fueled vehicles for its fleets. As described in Section 2.4, in Executive Order 111, Governor Pataki directed that State agency light-duty vehicle purchases must be at least 50 percent alternative fueled vehicles by 2005 and 100 percent by 2010.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

American Lung Association of Nassau-Suffolk

We support tax credits and other incentives to purchase and use low emission vehicles such as the new electric gas hybrid vehicles and the zero emission electric cars.

Response: The State Energy Plan calls for extending the New York Alternate Fuels Tax Credit Program and suggests that consideration be given to expanding it to include all types of alternative fueled vehicles. If this recommendation is adopted, tax credits are likely to become available for zero emission electric cars.

New York Corn Growers Association

On pages 47-48, the Draft State Energy Plan states “the substitution of ethanol for MTBE would result in over a hundred million dollars a year loss in New York State contribution to the Highway Trust Fund.” Increasing ethanol in New York will reduce the Highway Trust Fund but the report doesn't provide an actual analysis of the dollar value. New York Corn Growers and the Renewable Fuels Association (RFA) are working in Washington to eliminate this problem.

Response: As described in Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, of the State Energy Plan, the analysis is based on the projected use of ethanol to replace the existing use of MTBE (methyl tertiary butyl ether) and the \$ 0.54 per gallon excise tax exemption. Estimating the impact on revenue to New York State is difficult since this is an ongoing issue in other states as well as New York that will affect the total amount of revenue generated to the Highway Trust Fund and, therefore, will affect New York State's share. For this reason, favorable tax treatment for ethanol must be addressed at the federal level. New York appreciates any assistance in determining how to resolve the problem of reduced Highway Trust Fund resources caused by the increasing use of ethanol.

Center for Clean Air Policy

On the transportation front, there are a number of opportunities to ensure that State investments minimize greenhouse gases (GHGs). For instance, the State could incorporate GHG emissions as a key decisionmaking criterion into transportation and infrastructure investments and land use planning decisions and should consider withholding funds from investments that increase vehicle miles travelled, energy use and CO₂ emissions. In addition, New York can amend SEQRA (State Environmental Quality Review Act), Long Range Transportation Plans, TIP (Transportation Improvement Programs), and STIP (Statewide Transportation Improvement Program) processes to include GHG impacts.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

Key opportunities link transportation, land use, and climate change through policies that strengthen the urban core and protect the fringes to prevent suburban sprawl. The State should target open space funding to prevent suburban sprawl, promote Quality Communities, and protect land threatened by development. The State should complement open space protection by providing incentives for redevelopment on brownfields and encouraging infill development in urban cores across the State.

Response: New York recognizes the importance of reducing greenhouse gas emissions. Consequently, the State Energy Plan supports a statewide goal for greenhouse gas emission reductions. Achieving this goal will require emission reductions by all sectors, including the transportation sector. Many of the proposed measures are recommended in the State Energy Plan.

Center for Clean Air Policy

The State should demonstrably increase the share of transportation funding that is dedicated to improving and expanding transit, bike, and pedestrian facilities and should provide incentives to encourage use of these efficient alternatives.

Response: Transportation funding in New York now takes a balanced, multimodal approach, with funding provided for transit, rail, biking, walking, aviation, roadways, and other modes of transportation. The State Energy Plan recommends that the State redirect transportation funding toward energy-efficiency transportation alternatives, including public transportation, walking, and bicycling, and provide incentives to encourage greater use of related alternatives that improve transportation efficiency.

Environmental Defense

The State could expand alternative fuel and diesel emission control programs to garbage trucks, school buses, and other fleets.

The MTA and the New York Thruway Authority should adopt a modest congestion pricing structure to encourage shifts from use of Single Occupancy Vehicles to multi-occupant vehicles and from trucks to rail or barge. With E-Z pass technology, congestion pricing could be applied to other congested roadways that are not currently tolled in a non-intrusive way.

The State could raise energy taxes or energy greenhouse gas (GHG) offset fees. The State should adopt a steadily increasing gas or general energy GHG offset fee, perhaps two to five cents per year for the next ten to twenty years.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

The State should revamp the sales tax on vehicle purchases to vary inversely with the fuel economy of vehicles.

The “transitchek” programs provide huge potential to offer incentives to commuters to use subways, buses, commuter rail, and van services.

Suburban parts of the downstate metropolitan area and other urban areas in the State could offer employer-supported van services.

These various proposals could generate revenues for a transportation fund that could augment investments in mass transit and corporate van services and freight rail and barge. The State has huge needs in this respect.

Response: The State is now working to expand alternative fuel and diesel emission control programs to other fleets. In addition to garbage trucks and school buses, construction vehicles and ground support vehicles at airports are being considered as are technologies that reduce the need for heavy duty vehicles to idle.

The Port Authority of New York and New Jersey has adopted a congestion pricing structure for its bridge and tunnel crossings. The New York State Thruway Authority has considered such a program for the Tappan Zee Bridge. Congestion pricing is being considered in a more comprehensive manner for the New York City Metropolitan Area. Further information on this, the Transitchek and Commuter Choice programs, and van services can be found in Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation.

It is true that a huge need exists for investment in public transportation, freight rail and barge, and similar programs. A number of programs, such as the Clean Water/Clean Air Bond Act and the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality program in non-attainment and maintenance areas, now provide funding for energy-efficient transportation programs. In addition, significant assistance for activities of this type is provided through normal transportation funding mechanisms that are administered by the Department of Transportation and local transportation agencies, operating through Metropolitan Planning Organizations. Transportation experts generally recognize that changes in the price of gasoline, including taxes, do not significantly affect driving behavior. Generally, the same level of driving occurs regardless of the price of gasoline. As evidence, it should be noted that the recent volatility in the gasoline prices has not been associated with significant changes in vehicle miles traveled. Raising gasoline taxes may have adverse effects on low-income communities and small businesses.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

Ann Link

New York needs support for a network of greenways for foot and bike traffic. Brooklyn waterfront residents are having to fight with the New York City Department of Transportation for space free of cars and trucks so we can have a walk/bikeway along the waterfront.

Response: Section 2.4 of the State Energy Plan, Energy and Transportation, describes the support the State provides for bicycle lanes and pedestrian walkways. Concerns about funding and approvals for specific bikeway projects should be addressed to the appropriate metropolitan planning organization which, through an extensive public involvement process, will determine the transportation projects to receive support and be implemented.

Sierra Club, NYC Group

The Draft State Energy Plan should include an increase in the gasoline tax dedicated solely to the funding of increased energy conservation and efficiency, including reducing the use of passenger vehicles.

Investment in public transportation systems and rail freight transport must be a part of the Draft State Energy Plan. Also, clean vehicles and other alternatives such as pedestrian-friendly areas and bicycle-friendly streets should be a part of the Draft State Energy Plan. Market-based programs should be included. The State should be required to purchase clean vehicles and, if alternate fuel vehicles are purchased, to use the alternative fuels.

Response: A number of programs, such as the Clean Water/Clean Air Bond Act and the Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality program in non-attainment and maintenance areas, provide funding for energy-efficient transportation programs and for programs to reduce the use of single occupant vehicles. In addition, significant assistance for these activities is provided through normal transportation funding mechanisms that are administered by New York State Department of Transportation and local transportation agencies, operating through Metropolitan Planning Organizations.

The issues raised in the comment regarding public transportation, rail freight transport, and bicycle and pedestrian programs are discussed in the Energy and Transportation issue report (Section 2.4) in the State Energy Plan. The State is leading by example by purchasing alternative fueled vehicles for its fleets. As described in the issue report, in Executive Order 111, Governor Pataki directed that State agency light-duty

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

vehicle purchases must be at least 50 percent alternative fueled vehicles by 2005 and 100 percent by 2010.

Key Span, New York

Key Span believes the State should take a harder look at providing tax and other incentives for expansion of a number of compressed natural gas facilities in the New York City area.

We think expediting Article VII and the New York State Department of Transportation permitting processes for gas infrastructure are also critical to maintain that.

Response: To encourage the use of compressed natural gas and other forms of alternate fuels, the State Energy Plan calls for extending the New York Alternate Fuels Tax Credit Program and asks that consideration be given to expanding it to include all types of alternative fueled vehicles. The recommendation also applies to the development of alternate fuel infrastructure.

Article VII and the New York State Department of Transportation permitting processes implement State and federal law. Where appropriate, waiver provisions in the regulatory process are used. Substantive changes to the permitting process would require legislative revisions.

Doug Goodman

Speaking as an individual on behalf of the propane industry, I wholeheartedly support the alternative fuel vehicle tax credit program that you have in place, the extension of the deadline, and, specifically, the statement in there about fuel neutrality. Propane is a viable alternative to compressed or liquified natural gas throughout the United States and many governmental and private fleets rely on it. I want to voice my support for continuing the credit plan and offering propane as another alternative fuel.

Response: The comment is acknowledged and appreciated.

Environmental Advocates of New York

We believe the Draft State Energy Plan should improve transportation options to reduce environmental effects of transportation in the State, setting specific numerical targets for the transportation sector and setting out a program of investment in public transit, rail freight infrastructure, continuing promotion of clean vehicles, providing

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

pedestrian and bicycling alternatives and pricing policies. Progress should be tracked by vehicle miles traveled, modal split, fuel economy, and so on.

New York's adoption of all California's LEV2 program should be supported further, including consumer incentive programs, income tax credits for clean vehicles, and marketing and labeling programs along the lines of ENERGY STAR®.

We also think there should be a fuel economy based registration fee administered by the Department of Motor Vehicles.

Response: In supporting specific goals for greenhouse gas reductions and energy efficiency improvements, the State Energy Plan establishes metrics that will cause all sectors, including the transportation sector, to become more energy efficient. Separate metrics for the transportation sector are unnecessary.

Transportation professionals generally recognize that the costs of driving (vehicle registration, gasoline, and insurance) are inelastic, *i.e.*, changes in these costs do not have a significant effect on driving behavior. Generally, the same level of driving occurs regardless of the cost of driving. Increasing registration fees and gasoline taxes may have an adverse effect on low-income communities and small businesses.

Jennifer Bostaph

Traffic needs to flow more efficiently across the Peace Bridge.

Response: Studies are ongoing with regard to the Peace Bridge. Several alternatives are being studied, including one that would “twin” the bridge. Operational enhancements are also under study for the border crossings. For example, E-Z Pass was implemented on the Peace Bridge in January 2002. Further information on these studies is available from the Department of Transportation Region 5 Office in Buffalo.

Jennifer Bostaph

NYS provides \$1.7 billion in operating expenses for public transportation. The Draft State Energy Plan should show the breakdown on how much each city receives.

Response: The requested information is available from the New York State Department of Transportation website, www.dot.state.ny.us.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

Jennifer Bostaph

Public transportation is an important part of reducing energy use. There needs to be more emphasis on the benefits of using public transportation. The State needs to provide more publicity and information on these benefits.

The State needs to put more emphasis on walking and biking, and more bike parking should be made available.

Response: Energy and Transportation, Section 2.4 of the State Energy Plan, stresses the importance of public transportation, walking and biking, and other means of improving the energy efficiency of the transportation system.

Jennifer Bostaph

The Draft State Energy Plan does not address transportation issues in all areas of the State. Only New York City and Long Island are addressed.

Response: Most of the information in Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, of the State Energy Plan is applicable to the entire State, and pages 2-59 *et seq.* discuss specific activities in upstate New York.

Lawrence D'Arco

Encouraging the use of mass transit is probably one of the fastest ways to reduce oil consumption.

The Draft State Energy Plan states that the yearly maximum set-aside for pre-tax eligibility is \$780. According to the Federal Tax Code, as of January 1, 2002, the limit on nontaxable transit benefits an employee can receive was raised to \$100 per month or \$1,200 per year.

The Energy Plan should read that the Governor should implement the pre-tax income transit initiative.

The federal government offers both a transportation fringe payment (\$65 per month) and the pre-tax for federal employees who wish to participate in the program. New York State should offer the same transportation fringe benefits to its employees.

Response: The State Energy Plan recommends the adoption of a Commuter Choice program. (See Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation.) Efforts are underway to

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

bring the program to New York State employees, and discussions have begun with public employee unions to accomplish this. The correction with regard to yearly maximum set-aside is included in the State Energy Plan.

Marshah-Reaff Barrett

The Draft State Energy Plan states that “The State has become a national leader in developing new technologies to reduce emissions from diesel-powered trucks and buses.” If the technology exists, why isn’t it being used?

Response: Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, and Section 2.3, Energy and the Environment, describe how the State is using new technologies such as diesel-powered trucks and buses.

Marshah-Reaff Barrett

Fuel economy standards for vehicles have the potential to be the most significant action to conserve energy and protect the environment in the transportation sector. Why doesn’t NYS mandate that car companies improve on the fuel efficiency of cars?

The State must inspire car companies to meet higher engine efficiency and gas consumption efficiency, if the companies meet the new standards, they will receive a tax break or some other compensation.

Response: Under federal law, New York is precluded from establishing individual vehicle standards. New York's only option was to adopt California vehicle standards, which has been done. For this reason, the State Energy Plan encourages the federal government to adopt new corporate average fuel economy standards for vehicles and to address vehicle energy efficiency in a way that protects drivers and passengers.

To encourage the use of energy efficient vehicles, the State Energy Plan recommends extending the New York Alternate Fuels Tax Credit Program and that consideration be given to expanding it to all types of alternative fueled vehicles. The recommendation also applies to the development of alternate fuel infrastructure.

Shirley M. Victor

The Energy Plan should educate the public and encourage them to use public transportation.

Response: Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation, devotes significant discussion to public transportation. In doing so, the Energy Planning Board is trying to educate the

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

public on the benefits of public transportation. Transit operators are continually advertising and marketing their services to the public.

Robert Lambert

Tax rebates should be provided to companies that provide and promote vehicles that use Ethanol.

Response: The issue of ethanol use in vehicles is a complicated one. Ethanol provides benefits by reducing reliance on foreign sources of energy and promoting economic development. However, ethanol presents air quality problems because its use increases evaporative emissions and, because it receives more favorable tax treatment than other fuels, its use negatively affects funding available to maintain and enhance the transportation system. The State Energy Plan takes a balanced approach to this issue.

Diane A. Davis

Fuel cells for cars are not truly and adequately addressed or compensated for in the Draft State Energy Plan.

Response: Fuel cells for cars are not addressed in Section 2.4, the Energy and Transportation issue report. The State Energy Plan discuss fuels cells in Section 3.3, the Renewable Energy Assessment. Use of fuel cells by the transportation sector holds great potential for increasing energy efficiency and reducing emissions. As is pointed out in the Renewable Energy Assessment, each of the fuel cell technologies under development has advantages and drawbacks and none can cheaply and efficiently replace more conventional fuel sources. At this point in time, it is premature to develop transportation energy policy based on uncertain fuel cell technology. The State supports the continued research and development of this technology, including its transportation applications.

New York Public Interest Research Group, Niagara Chapter

While the low emission vehicle program that is mentioned in Section 2, page 40, of the draft State Energy Plan is fabulous, I feel that recreational vehicles such as jet skis, boats, and motorcycles should also be given emission standards to help with the problem.

Response: New York State is taking steps to reduce emissions from off-road motor vehicles. Legislation was recently enacted calling on the Department of Environmental Conservation to establish emission standards for marine recreational vehicles such as jet-skis. Regulations are being developed and should be issued for public comment shortly. Motorcycles are regulated pursuant to federal law that prohibits states

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

from setting their own emission standards for such vehicles. California is excluded from this prohibition, and New York has the option of adopting either the federal or California standards.

Brett Maxwell

The State should encourage hybrid and alternative fuel vehicles.

Kenya Browning

Alternative fuel vehicles are pricey, but worth it. Why not have all State agency vehicles as alternative fuel vehicles rather than just the light duty ones?

Response: The State Energy Plan encourages the development and use of alternative fueled vehicles in two important ways. The Energy Plan recommends extending the New York Alternate Fuels Tax Credit Program and that consideration be given to expanding it to all types of alternative fueled vehicles. The recommendation also applies to the development of alternate fuel infrastructure. The State is leading by example by purchasing alternative fueled vehicles for its fleets. As described in the Energy Plan (see Section 2.4, Energy and Transportation), in Executive Order 111, Governor Pataki directed that State agency light-duty vehicle purchases must be at least 50 percent alternative fueled vehicles by 2005 and 100 percent by 2010. Hybrid vehicles are covered under the Executive Order. Further, the Executive Order addresses medium- and heavy-duty vehicles by requiring agencies to “implement strategies to reduce petroleum consumption and emissions by using alternative fuels and improving vehicle fleet fuel efficiency.” As alternate fuel technology develops for non-light-duty vehicles and as more types of vehicles are available, to fulfill the Executive Order, it is expected that State agencies will purchase more of these vehicles also.

The Business Council of New York State, Inc.

We support the Draft State Energy Plan's call for additional federal funding for transit and transportation system operations.

Response: Support for the State Energy Plan's call for additional federal funding for transit and transportation system operations is acknowledged and appreciated.

Kenya Browning

Emission reductions (described on page 2-88 of the draft State Energy Plan) should include replacement of bulbs with LEDs in traffic signals and efforts to enhance the bicycle and pedestrian programs.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.

Response: Replacement of bulbs with light emitting diodes (LEDs) and enhancing bicycle and pedestrian programs are ongoing efforts that result in emission reductions. As is pointed out in Section 2.4 of the State Energy Plan, other transportation measures can be adopted that will produce larger emission reductions on a more cost-effective basis.

Note: Comments are grouped according to similarity of contents, and a response may address more than one comment. In those cases, the response is placed at the end of the series of comments. Long series of comments will include a page reference to the response.